

# Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

## **DATGANIADAU O DDIDDORDEB**

Mae gofyn i aelodau o'r Panel, arsyllwyr a phartïon perthnasol eraill ddatgan unrhyw ddi-ddordebau sydd ganddynt **ymlaen llaw** mewn perthynas â'r eitemau Panel Adolygu Dylunio. Bydd unrhyw ddatganiadau o'r fath yn cael eu cofnodi yma ac yng nghofnodion canolog Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

## **DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS**

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare ***in advance*** any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCfW's central records.

## **Statws adolygu/Review status**

## **Cyhoedd/Public**

Dyddiad cyfarfod/meeting date	23 May 2011
Dyddiad cyhoeddi/issue date	31 May 2011
Lleoliad y cynllun/scheme location	Morrisons Torfaen
Disgrifiad y cynllun/scheme description	Mixed use development
Statws cynllunio/planning status	Detailed: Sites 1& 3 Outline: Site 2 Submitted March 2011

Datganiadau o ddi-ddordeb/Declaration of interests:

Some years ago David Harvey worked with Duncan Smith of Torfaen CBC. There is no current relationship.

## **Cyflwyniad/Presentation**

- 1.1 This scheme was previously presented at Design Review in August 2009 and has since been reviewed in line with a broader masterplanning approach to the site. The current planning application was submitted in March 2011 and it is expected to come before the Planning Committee in June 2011.
- 1.2 The team explained that the site has been split into three sections. This presentation and detailed planning application relates to Site 1 (to the north) on which a Morrisons store, car park and smaller retail units are planned, and to Site 3 (to the south), which details the development and improvement of the Arvin Meritor factory. The team suggested that development of these areas will create c700 new employment opportunities. Site 2 is currently the subject of an outline planning application.

- 1.3 The main proposal for the Morrisons store on Site 1 aims to link with a public square, connecting this area of the site to the remaining sections, and also to create a seamless easterly extension to Cwmbran town centre. The proposals provide a new pedestrian network into the town centre, at ground level, from the station and surrounding development. Access is via a pedestrian bridge served by stairs and a lift from the Morrisons car park, to connect to the pedestrian walkway adjacent to the Vue cinema and retail units, located approximately 5m above ground level. There are also public realm proposals at ground level to connect Llantarnam Grange Arts Centre to a proposed public space in Site 2.
- 1.4 The team is working with Hyder consulting to ensure that a drainage and flood prevention strategy is in place and the developer aspiration is for a BREEAM Very Good rating for the development of Sites 1 and 3.
- 1.5 The Local Authority (LA) attended the review, commenting that outline planning permission is in place and that they welcomed the changes implemented since the last review. However they have some remaining concerns. These include the proposed use of glass on the pedestrian bridge; the visual quality of the scheme; the lack of planting in the car park areas and the intention to reduce the number of existing trees on the site.

**Crynodeb o'r prif bwyntiau a gododd o'r drafodaeth, i'w darllen ochr yn ochr ag Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn.**

**Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.**

- 2.1 The Panel thanked the team for a presentation which usefully reiterated the historical context and principles of the design of the town centre, which sought to separate pedestrians and vehicles – a different approach to current design thinking and policy guidance set out in the Manual for Streets.
- 2.2 The Panel thought that aspirations for the development of the overall site had progressed in a positive way since the last review, but that the design approach for unlocking the potential of Site 2, together with the aspirations of the LA to extend a pedestrian friendly approach in to the town centre, and north to the train station, remained major issues to be resolved.

In summary:

- The differing levels of the three sites, the surrounding area and how these are being managed/designed are not fully resolved. Site sections are required to illustrate the detailed design approach.
- Alternative routes of approach to and from the town centre with a choice of bridge or surface crossing could dilute the effectiveness of a strong pedestrian route, reducing potential for activity in the proposed new public square.
- The Panel is concerned about the supermarket and petrol station access proposals, from the roundabout at the entrance to Site 1. Management

of traffic flow and conflicts with pedestrian movement to the station at this junction could be problematic.

- A lack of tree planting in the car park of the Morrisons development is regrettable and should be reviewed.
- The landscape proposals and their effect on the strong established tree belt alongside St David's Way, requires detailed design.
- Design development of Site 2 is crucial to unlocking not only the realistic commercial capacity of the site, but also to consider the appropriate public realm connections and the size and aspect of the proposed public spaces. This requires further attention and should include the use of spill-out spaces and spatial enclosure to activate the proposed public square.

## **Adran 2/Part 2**

### **Trafodaeth ac Ymateb y Panel yn Llawn Discussion and panel response in full**

- 3.1 The Panel welcomed the design development since the last review and noted the intention to develop the wider area as an integrated scheme, as a positive step.
- 3.2 Development of a movement and access strategy to connect this eastern expansion area to the town centre remains problematic and the Panel felt that detailed design issues remain unresolved as the scheme still exhibited aspects of an 'out of town' approach to what is essentially a town centre expansion, with a well connected pedestrian network.
- 3.3 Vehicular access to Sites 1 and 2 remains a concern. Access to Site 1 via the existing roundabout may be difficult as this will be a busy feeder into the supermarket site. Access to Site 2 and the redeveloped factory, off the existing road network, remains problematic in attempting to balance the objectives of a pedestrian crossing with vehicular movements on what is essentially a ring road. The closure of Grange Road was viewed as a benefit to the town centre.
- 3.4 Attention was drawn to how best to detail the creation of the bridge from Site 1 to the cinema and how this would link to the Llantarnam Grange Arts Centre. The Panel felt that too little exploratory design attention had been paid to the way in which the two levels could work together. The focus has been on the bridge link being delivered in the Site 1 application without sufficient development of the design for Site 2 public realm and consideration of the interface with Llantarnam Grange across St. David's Road and into the town centre. Beyond the pedestrian connections, the public realm and specifically the public square proposed for Site 2 need to be reviewed in terms of size, orientation and most importantly, active frontage opportunities surrounding it. The Panel considered that these had not been adequately resolved and that a framework should accompany the outline application in order to ensure the delivery of the aspirations for the site.

3.5 A lack of built form and frontage to St David's Way was identified and considered together with the location of the Morrisons store. The LA commented that they had concerns about moving the proposed store as it would restrict the view of Site 2 from the roundabout. They also considered that the position of parking to the west of the site would assist with ongoing parking constraints in the area.

**Mae Panel Adolygu Dylunio Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a'r staff yn croesawu rhagor o ymgynghoriad, a bydd yn hapus i ddarparu rhagor o adborth am yr adroddiad yma a/neu lle bo'n briodol, dderbyn cyflwyniadau pellach. Diolch am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn a chadwch mewn cysylltiad â ni os gwelwch yn dda ynglŷn â hynt eich prosiect. A fydddech gystal â'n hysbysu o ddatblygiad eich prosiect. Diolch yn fawr am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn.**

**The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel welcomes further consultation and we will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Please keep us informed of the progress of your project. Thank you for consulting the Commission.**

***Mae copi iath Gymraeg o'r adroddiad hwn ar gael ar ofyn.  
A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.***

#### **Atodiad 1/appendix 1 Mynychwyr/attendees**

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr Agent/Client/Developer	Morrisons, Mark Thompson
Pensaer/Dylunydd Trefol Architectural/Urban Designer	DLA Architecture – John Orrel
Ymgynghorwyr/Consultants	B:SSEC - Sam Hunt Peacock and Smith - Chris Creighton
Awdurdod Cynllunio/Planning Authority	Torfaen County Borough Council Duncan Smith Craig Mead Richard Lewis
Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/Design Review Panel Cadeirydd/Chair Prif Banelydd/Lead Panellist	Wendy Richards Simon Carne David Harvey Chris Jones Jonathan Hines Sue Jones
Sylwedyddion/Observers	Gayna Jones - DCfW Commissioner