

Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

DATGANIADAU O DDIDDORDEB

Mae gofyn i aelodau o'r panel, arsyllwyr a phartion perthnasol eraill ddatgan unrhyw ddi-ddordebau sydd ganddynt **ymlaen llaw** mewn perthynas â'r eitemau Panel Adolygu Dylunio Bydd unrhyw ddatganiadau o'r fath yn cael eu cofnodi yma ac yng nghofnodion canolog Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare ***in advance*** any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCfW's central records.

Statws adolygu/Review status

Cyfrinachol/Confidential

Dyddiad cyfarfod/meeting date	July 6th 2011
Dyddiad cyhoeddi/issue date	July 12th 2011
Lleoliad y cynllun/scheme location	St Fagans museum
Disgrifiad y cynllun/scheme description	New build, refurbishment, landscape works, masterplan
Statws cynllunio/planning status	Cyn gwneud cais/pre-application

Datganiadau o ddiddordeb/declaration of interests

1. Ashley Bateson declared that Hoare Lea is working with Feilden Clegg Bradley on a separate project. He is not directly involved.
2. Carole-Anne Davies, Chief Executive of DCfW, is a Trustee of Amgueddfa Cymru

Adran 1/part 1

Cyflwyniad/Presentation

The Chair opened the meeting by outlining some important strategic issues which were outstanding from previous meetings and discussions. These were: clarity of the overall vision; the importance of the landscape strategy as an overarching framework for the whole project; movement strategy and interpretation.

The Director General of Amgueddfa Cymru spoke about the client's aspiration for a participatory museum, engaging with all sections of the community. There was a recognition that Wales is a multi-cultural country and that the national identity is fluid and changing. The importance of understanding the past, in order to be able to

shape the future, was emphasised. The overall vision for the project was to engage with the 'Minds, Hearts and Hands' of Wales.

It was agreed to structure the discussion around the four main areas of: landscape; sustainability; the new building; and the existing main building.

Landscape

The Panel requested clarity on the status of the 1908 Pettigrew landscape plan in the context of the public realm and landscape strategy for the site as a whole, including the relocation of the Celtic Village, opening up views to exhibits, encouraging access to the castle, and the arrival experience.

The team stated that the landscape strategy will respect the layers of history while allowing for sustainable growth and protecting the existing ecological diversity. Two masterplans are being developed – one to illustrate the current proposals for the Heritage Lottery Fund application, and the second to guide the development of the landscape over the next 5-10 years.

The proposed circulation diagram shows a strong spine route, aligned to include the site of the new building and draw visitors towards the southern part of the site. In the wooded areas to the south a footpath hierarchy will be developed based on the 1908 plan. New buildings or exhibitions will be located within the wooded 'glade' areas, leaving the nodes and rides clear for access and views.

With regard to car parking, the team is looking at options for additional capacity. The intention is to relocate the coach parking area away from the front of the main building, but allowing for a coach drop-off point close to the entrance. The client stated that a possible site for newly acquired urban buildings would be to the west of the car park.

Sustainability

The target for the new building is a bespoke BREEAM rating of Excellent and an EPC 'A' rating. For the main building the team hope to achieve BREEAM Very Good. This will be particularly demanding because of the nature of the construction, together with the recent listing of this building. The main building represents a large part of the site's energy use, and so could potentially have a big effect in reducing demand. The M&E works will include a major overhaul of existing systems. Sustainable drainage systems (SUDS) will be adopted, including the evaluation of rainwater recycling and the minimisation of surface water run-off rates.

New Building:

The Panel's previously expressed reservations relating to the choice of site were noted. However, taking the current preferred site as a given, our concerns have mainly been about the relationship of the proposed new building with the 1908 plan node and the tannery.

The current option under consideration shows the site levels raised to form a roughly level plateau for a single storey building. Its relocation further to the north

west of the site achieves a better relationship with the village centre and the main approaches.

Reflecting its function both as an end point and a threshold, the design shows a high degree of visual permeability, intended to draw people into and through it. Wide steps to the north east will act as an informal gathering point and a flush threshold to the south will lead to the relocated Celtic Village and Open Air Archaeology. There will be a blending of indoor and outdoor spaces and functions, supported by a covered loggia to the south and multiple entrance points.

Existing building

The design team had met recently with the original architect for this building from the Percy Thomas Partnership and this had helped their understanding of the design concept and phases of construction.

The Cadw representative supplied a copy of the recent listing report and confirmed that they would support the proposed glazed roof for the courtyard to enable it to be brought back into active use as part of the entrance experience. However, Cadw would prefer to see the West Concourse area retained in its present form.

Crynodeb o'r prif bwyntiau a gododd o'r drafodaeth, i'w darllen ochr yn ochr ag Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn.

Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.

The Panel welcomed the opportunity for a first review of this significant scheme for Wales. We think that good progress has been made to date and view this presentation as a successful conclusion of RIBA Stages A and B. Given the stage of development of the project, we think there are still major issues which remain to be resolved. In summary:

- We are encouraged to see the way in which the landscape strategy is being developed as a strong framework underpinning all other aspects of the project. In addition to the landscape management of the site, it should contribute a contemporary layer of landscape design appropriate to each building.
- The emerging masterplan should clearly indicate which areas of the site would be appropriate for future development, including additions to the historic buildings collection, and which are to be kept as landscape: untouched, restored or newly designed.
- It will be important to ensure that the landscape design keeps in step with and responds to the developing designs for the building. Sufficient funds must be allocated for the site-wide landscape management strategy, including the spine route, and for public realm/landscape works directly adjacent to the buildings/parking infrastructure and entrance. It is not clear what will be achieved with the current budget.

- We are encouraged by the design development of the new building and urged the design team to be innovative in their use of local materials.
- We thought there were positive aspects in the developing layout for the main building, including introduction of visitors and active uses to the courtyard, and a more logical and interesting route through the building for visitors. However, we were not convinced that access to the galleries has yet been optimised.
- We have serious concerns about the adequacy of the budget to meet all the requirements of the project, without loss of design quality or compromise in other aspirational areas such as sustainability.
- We would like to see this project again, ideally about half way through the Stage C design process, which should be in September/October. The team anticipate a planning application being made by the end of the year.

Adran 2/part 2

Trafodaeth ac Ymateb y Panel yn Llawn Discussion and panel response in full

Landscape

The Panel noted the proposals for opening up and restoring the nodes and rides within the wooded areas, but was still unclear about the exact status of the 1908 plan (and the strategy for it) and whether it was seen as an absolute given, or a guiding principle. We were informed that this would be discussed again at a meeting with Cadw next week, along with the client's requirements relating to access to the open air archaeology, its visibility, and distance from the main building.

The Panel was reassured that a strong landscape strategy was emerging which would form the framework for the current project and guide future development. We thought it was important that the masterplan(s) should identify the areas of the site which would be available to accommodate future acquisitions, and those which were deemed not suitable for development in the future - effectively 'no build zones'. These areas should be agreed with Cadw to give some certainty for development of the site in the future.

The Panel understood that part of the work involved in re-establishing the 1908 Pettigrew plan would fall within the remit of this project, and other work such as clearing paths would be covered by long term landscape management. While we agreed that the 1908 plan represents a significant moment in the history of this site, we also thought that the mediaeval routes and rides were important, and that some contemporary landscape intervention would be an appropriate addition to the historic development of the landscape and essential to guide people round the site without the use of signage.

The Panel observed that little attention had so far been paid to the 'arrival experience', beyond a proposal to re-locate the coach park. The client team confirmed that up to now they have been concentrating on a predicted increase in demand for car parking and options for accommodating additional visitor numbers,

while encouraging alternative transport options. The Panel considered that the route from the car parks to the entrance should form an essential part of the assessment for each of the car park options.

Regarding the two options presented for access to the castle, the client stated that they wished to pursue the preferred option of a new footpath link connecting to the existing gates, and were confident that this would be a workable arrangement. The space at the rear of the main building was recognised as a crucial decision point for visitors, and the landscape/orientation teams are working on an orientation design which encourages a 'right turn' towards the castle, although no proposals for this were presented.

The Panel suggested that the team produce a 'storyboard' or serial vision of the site as experienced by the visitor, using photographs and sketches to understand and evaluate what could be seen from where and identify opportunities where the landscape may be opened up to views to make a connection between various parts of the park. Hayley Sharpe is currently developing a communications strategy for the visitor journey and identifying decision points. An ecological statement has been sent to Cardiff CC and the team awaits their comments.

The Panel was informed that the budget for landscape design and works was £0.5m, and a prioritised list of works was being developed.

Sustainability

The team was aware of the constraints involved in improving the energy performance of the listed building, but with an integrated design approach and an early pre-assessment this should be readily achievable. We agreed that there were also opportunities to offset difficulties in some areas – eg improving wall and window U-values – by bigger gains in other areas. It was noted that controlled environmental conditions will need to be maintained in the gallery spaces.

The Panel highlighted the importance of a coordinated approach to site-wide issues such as water, drainage and waste. We were assured that whole life costings will be used in evaluating various options. Although not specifically mentioned in the Stage A/B report, it was confirmed that solar technologies will be included in the feasibility assessment.

The importance of adequate metering, to monitor future demand and consumption, was acknowledged. The Panel urged the team to build in provision for post-occupancy monitoring, and investigate possible funding sources for a 'soft landings' study.

The team is working with Cardiff CC and Sustrans to improve cycle access and provision. Other aspects of a green transport plan include a possible 'tourism bus route' linking a number of sites in the area. Charging points for electric cars/mobility vehicles should be considered.

The Panel advised the team to demonstrate a strong commitment to high standards of environmental performance, as 'targets' and 'aspirations' were vulnerable to being eroded when looking for cost savings.

New building

The Panel thought that there was a welcome clarity emerging in the developing design. A shift to flat roof forms is intended to reduce the apparent height and visual impact of the building as well as providing the opportunity for green/brown roof finishes. This is important as the roof will be visible and potentially accessible, and the Panel urged the team to provide views of the building to illustrate its visibility and setting in different seasons. We welcomed the single storey solution which will facilitate movement in and out of the building, and give the cafe access to outdoor space.

The Panel agreed that the building form maximises the opportunity for peripheral activity and provides the opportunity to create the desired transparency and a strong relationship with the outdoor spaces. The potential for an attractive public space to be developed between this building and the Tannery is welcomed. We thought that this latest option was a good basis for moving forward to Stage C design work, and encouraged the team to be innovative in their use of local materials. Ideally we would like to see an exploration of a modern vernacular for South Wales, based on genuine local provenance.

The Panel voiced some minor concerns relating to the precise alignment of the building in relation to the main spine and northern routes, and to the formality of the steps / plateau arrangement as shown in the most recent visuals. The architect stated that the approach to the building would be informal, given the overall scale, and the steps could be of a more domestic scale and designed to encourage informal gathering.

Consideration of ecological issues, including provision for bats and newts, has been programmed in and is the subject of discussions with CCW.

We were informed that the budget for this building is £2.6m, or approximately £2,700/m², to include the fit out for the exhibition space.

Existing building

In the light of comments from Cadw, the team clarified that they were considering modifications to the West Concourse, including an adjustment of the roof level, rather than its complete removal. The client wishes to mitigate the 'pinch point' effect of the current layout and it was agreed that a clear case would have to be made to justify these proposed alterations.

The client confirmed that they will apply for permission to demolish the toilet block and again a clear justification will be necessary in the light of its recent listing.

The Panel was supportive of the aspirations and general design approach to the re-modelling of the main building. The relocation of the main entrance is a positive feature, together with the slower route through the building and the different choices offered along the route. The decision to relocate storage and plant areas in a new basement level has freed up the ground floor area for a flexible exhibition space and new cafe with triple aspect.

The covered courtyard will give sufficient space to accommodate a banquet for 200 people, and access to the upper level galleries will be via ramps which themselves will be used for display opportunities. Visitors will be encouraged to pass through the galleries on their way to the outdoor exhibitions and we supported the suggestion to extend the exhibition space into the eastern wing as a visual enticement.

However, in the absence of section drawings, it was difficult for the Panel to fully understand the vertical layout of ramps and stairs. Full sections should be provided and a simple 3D working model would help convey the design intention accurately. While we thought that there were many positive features in the most recent plan, we were not convinced that access to the galleries had been sufficiently addressed.

The budget for this refurbishment now stands at £10-11m, and this is a major concern for the design team.

Mae Panel Adolygu Dylunio Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a'r staff yn croesawu rhagor o ymgynghoriad, a bydd yn hapus i ddarparu rhagor o adborth am yr adroddiad yma a/neu lle bo'n briodol, dderbyn cyflwyniadau pellach. Diolch am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn a chadwch mewn cysylltiad â ni os gwelwch yn dda ynglŷn â hynt eich prosiect. A fydddech gystal â'n hysbysu o ddatblygiad eich prosiect. Diolch yn fawr am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn.

The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel welcomes further consultation and we will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Please keep us informed of the progress of your project. Thank you for consulting the Commission.

***Mae copi iath Gymraeg o'r adroddiad hwn ar gael ar ofyn.
A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.***

Atodiad 1/appendix 1 Mynychwyr/attendees

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr
Agent/Client/Developer

Amgueddfa Cymru (David Anderson,
John Williams-Davies, Steve Howe, Elfyn
Hughes, Beth Thomas)

Pensaer/Dylunydd Trefol

Feilden Clegg Bradley (Richard Collis)

Architectural/Urban Designer	Purcell Miller Tritton (Jamie Coath) TEP (Graeme Atherton) Hayley Sharpe (Alisdair Hinshelwood)
Ymgynghorwyr/Consultants	Focus (Richard Aston) Arup (Sam Shooter)
Trydydd Parti/Third Party	Cadw (Peter Ashby)
Awdurdod Cynllunio/Planning Authority	Cardiff City Council (Annabelle Evans)
Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/ Design Review Panel Cadeirydd/Chair Swydog/Officer Prif Banelydd/Lead Panellists	Ewan Jones Cindy Harris Wendy Richards Andrew Linfoot Ashley Bateson Toby Adam
Sylwedyddion/Observers	n/a