

Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

DATGANIADAU O DDIDDORDEB

Mae gofyn i aelodau o'r panel, arsyllwyr a phartion perthnasol eraill ddatgan unrhyw ddi-ddordebau sydd ganddynt **ymlaen llaw** mewn perthynas â'r eitemau Panel Adolygu Dylunio. Bydd unrhyw ddatganiadau o'r fath yn cael eu cofnodi yma ac yng nghofnodion canolog Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare ***in advance*** any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCfW's central records.

Statws adolygu/Review status

Cyfrinachol/Confidential

Dyddiad cyfarfod/meeting date	October 19th 2011
Dyddiad cyhoeddi/issue date	November 2nd 2011
Lleoliad y cynllun/scheme location	Penllwyn, Llandyrnog
Disgrifiad y cynllun/scheme description	Preswyl/residential
Statws cynllunio/planning status	Cyn gwneud cais/ pre-application
Datganiadau o ddi-ddordeb/declaration of interests	None

Adran 1/part 1

Cyflwyniad/Presentation

The proposal is for a large detached house on a dramatic site containing an old quarry. It lies on the southern slopes of the Clwydian range near the hamlet of Llandyrnog and within the AONB. The upper part of the site has an existing house which is proposed for demolition, and the new building would have 2 storeys above plateau level, stepping down into the quarry which forms a natural amphitheatre. The site and surroundings are heavily wooded and we were told that only very distant views and close-up views from very specific locations are possible. The decision to step the building down the slope is intended to lessen any adverse visual impact.

The south west facing frontage is mainly steel and glass, while the rear of the building adjacent to the quarry face will be stonework and white render/panels.

This proposal appears to be in complete contravention of existing planning policy, although the planning consultant advises that there are precedents for comparable developments in the area.

Crynodeb o'r prif bwyntiau a gododd o'r drafodaeth, i'w darllen ochr yn ochr ag Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn.

Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.

The Panel was sympathetic to the clients' desire for a modern house in a superb setting, and thought that the relative invisibility of the site should allow for a bold, contemporary approach. However, this needs to be done with the utmost sensitivity to the landscape and possible visual impact. We think that this proposal is an unsatisfactory response to the site and context. In summary:

- The scale of the proposed building is excessive and in our view should be reduced to a maximum of one storey at plateau level, with a further one or two storeys below, and a smaller footprint.
- The built form should follow the contours of the quarry edge, rather than standing clear of the slope. Some excavation to allow the building to nestle in the landscape could be considered.
- A project such as this demands the highest standards of design, materials and detailing, and should make a considered response to the building traditions and materials of the locality (see policy HSG 8). This is yet to be demonstrated.
- The landscape strategy should seek to establish a sympathetic relationship between the building, the quarry face and the wooded setting. Restoring the quarry lake would make a positive contribution to the site's biodiversity.
- An appropriate and realistic sustainability strategy needs to be developed to support the application, with a clear commitment to high standards of energy efficiency and fabric performance, along with low carbon systems for power and heat.
- We would be pleased to see this scheme again at Design Review prior to the submission of a planning application.

Adran 2/part 2

**Trafodaeth ac Ymateb y Panel yn Llawn
Discussion and panel response in full**

The Panel observed that the size and scale of the proposed dwelling was likely to be resisted as a departure from planning policy (Denbighshire UDP. Policy HSG8 – Replacement Dwellings in the Open Countryside). While we were told that there was no architectural merit in the existing building, the case for demolition has not been sufficiently justified.

The Panel would have no objection to a well executed contemporary design approach on this site, but we do have serious concerns about the proposed scale of

the building. This is not a sensitive contextual response and the built form appears to be intrusive and strident, forming an uncomfortable relationship with the landscape setting.

We were not convinced by the 'cascade' approach as a way of disguising the building, and thought that a more modest building on the existing plateau might be more appropriate. If the building is to step down into the quarry it should be grounded more firmly, possibly on a stone plinth, and hugging the contours of the topography, rather than cantilevering out over the face of the quarry with very visible steel posts and a bare undercroft. Geological investigations to assess the viability of tying the building into the quarry face, should be carried out as soon as possible.

In our view the building height above plateau should be reduced by one storey, so that it sits at roughly the same height as the existing building. The facade treatment and window proportions need to be reconsidered, and all materials and details should be of exceptional quality and sympathetic to the locality. The circular stone staircases appear aggressive and we suggested they could be accommodated within the building. The solid balustrades on the balconies increase the apparent bulk, and could be made more transparent.

The Panel welcomed the aspirations for a highly sustainable dwelling, but this needs to be fully developed with a convincing strategy for low carbon performance and a commitment to achieve a high level of the Code for Sustainable Homes (eg Level 4 or 5). The proposed wood burning system is not conducive to intermittent occupation, and the heating strategy should fit well with the lifestyle of the residents. Any systematic tree-felling for fuel supply should be matched with a re-planting / coppicing scheme.

The landscape treatment for this sensitive site should be exemplary, and a landscape architect should be employed to ensure that the building works with the site contours and sits comfortably within the sylvan setting. Existing mature trees should be retained wherever possible. The suggested restoration of the quarry lake would be a very welcome contribution to the site's biodiversity.

In order to demonstrate the visual impact, the applicant should produce accurate long-distance views of the proposal from agreed vantage points and in winter conditions, as the worst case.

Mae Panel Adolygu Dylunio Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a'r staff yn croesawu rhagor o ymgynghoriad, a bydd yn hapus i ddarparu rhagor o adborth am yr adroddiad yma a/neu lle bo'n briodol, dderbyn cyflwyniadau pellach. Diolch am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn a chadwch mewn cysylltiad â ni os gwelwch yn dda ynglŷn â hynt eich prosiect. A fyddech gystal â'n hysbysu o ddatblygiad eich prosiect. Diolch yn fawr am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn.

The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel welcomes further consultation and we will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Please keep us

informed of the progress of your project. Thank you for consulting the Commission.

***Mae copi iath Gymraeg o'r adroddiad hwn ar gael ar ofyn.
A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.***

Atodiad 1/appendix 1 Mynychwyr/attendees

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr Agent/Client/Developer	Mr and Mrs Kreft
Pensaer/Dylunydd Trefol Architectural/Urban Designer	Christopher Sanders
Ymgynghorwyr/Consultants	n/a
Trydydd Parti/Third Party	n/a
Awdurdod Cynllunio/Planning Authority	Denbighshire CC
Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/ Design Review Panel Cadeirydd/Chair Swydog/Officer Prif Banelydd/Lead Panellist	John Punter Cindy Harris Kedrick Davies Lynne Sullivan David Harvey Michael Griffiths
Sylwedyddion/Observers	Philip Costa (CDN Planning) Philip Jardine (DCfW Commissioner)