

# Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

## DATGANIADAU O DDIDDORDEB

Mae gofyn i aelodau o'r panel, arsyllwyr a phartïon perthnasol eraill ddatgan unrhyw ddiddordebau sydd ganddynt ymlaen llaw mewn perthynas â'r eitemau Panel Adolygu Dylunio Bydd unrhyw ddatganiadau o'r fath yn cael eu cofnodi yma ac yng nghofnodion canolog Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

## DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare in advance any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCfW's central records.

### Statws adolygu/Review status

**Public**

Dyddiad cyfarfod/meeting date

July 6th 2011

Dyddiad cyhoeddi/issue date

July 19th 2011

Lleoliad y cynllun/scheme location

Llanmadoc, Gower

Disgrifiad y cynllun/scheme description

Commercial

Statws cynllunio/planning status

Application submitted

Datganiadau o ddiddordeb/declaration of interests None

### Adran 1/part 1

### Cyflwyniad/Presentation

The village of Llanmadoc saw its last shop close ten years ago. The community response was to set up a not-for-profit co-operative to run a shop staffed by volunteers which has been trading in a converted barn for the last few years. They have now been offered grant money for new premises, and have acquired an infill site in the village.

There has been a high level of local consultation and community response. These proposals for a new building have received overwhelming support following a public exhibition of the plans. Out of the 250 village residents, approximately 150 are members of the co-op and have contributed financially to the project. The overall budget for the project excluding the land is £100,000.

The proposal is for a simple built form of 1.5 storeys, with a floor plan of 12m x 8.4m. The facades incorporate solar shading to the south and views are maximised across the estuary to the north. The envelope is highly insulated and an air source

heat pump is under consideration. External wall finishes will be white render and timber cladding, sourced locally. The timber ‘brises soleil’ drop down to form security shutters. The roof will use reclaimed Welsh slates which are available locally and will accommodate 25 m<sup>2</sup> of solar PV panels. Three parking spaces are provided in the forecourt which will avoid a hard surface finish.

**Crynodeb o’r prif bwyntiau a gododd o’r drafodaeth, i’w darllen ochr yn ochr ag Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn.**

**Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.**

While we understood that many details remain to be resolved, and we appreciated the challenge of working within a small fixed budget, the Panel considered this to be an exemplary design and development process to date. We think it is deserving of support from the wider community and the local authority, and could serve as a model for other small community projects. In summary:

- We are encouraged by the degree of community involvement in maintaining a village shop on a volunteer basis, and in developing this new project. The opportunity for community involvement in the construction phase should be explored.
- We commended the architectural approach of a simple, functional, energy-efficient building which responds well to its context. We would like to see the architect retained through RIBA Stage E and beyond, to protect the desired quality.
- A lobbied entrance would strengthen the simple ‘fabric first’ design approach to energy conservation and efficiency.
- It will be important to source natural or recycled materials locally, and community contacts could facilitate this process, while keeping costs low.
- The forecourt area should be informal and welcoming and we think that a retaining wall and barrier in front of the shop should be avoided, even if this means a slight increase in building height.

**Adran 2/part 2**

**Trafodaeth ac Ymateb y Panel yn Llawn  
Discussion and panel response in full**

The Panel considered this to be a simple, discreet and well-contained project which responds well to its immediate residential context, and has excellent community credentials. The clear presentation of the proposal enabled the Panel to appreciate the evolution of the design and the commitment of the client to a sustainable and locally grounded development. The architect stated that, despite the small size of the project, it was a significant scheme for the village, and they had engaged with the Design Review process because they wanted clear scrutiny for the project.

There have been pre-application discussions with the Local Authority who appear to have no in-principle objections, although there is currently a moratorium on development within the Bury Inlet catchment area. The client explained that, despite the high level of local consultation, they have not formally approached the Gower Society as their website discourages this. Trading hours will be limited to 10am-5pm on weekdays plus Saturday mornings, and the immediate neighbours are content with this.

The Panel requested details on the boundary treatments. To the east there will be a masonry enclosure for refuse/recycling, and then on both sides a hit-and-miss boarded fence, together with some planting. The northern boundary with open fields will have a post-and-wire fence, and it is hoped to plant new fruit trees to replace the ones removed from the front boundary. The form of the building has been arranged to avoid any overlooking of neighbouring properties.

The Panel questioned the desirability of a parking forecourt, but after some discussion we accepted that a small amount of parking provision was necessary, given the narrow carriageway of the adjacent road and the potential for congestion if cars park on the road or the verge. The forecourt finish will be a soft, porous one, but the limitations of grasscrete are acknowledged, especially with vehicles manoeuvring across the surface, and this is yet to be determined. The Panel suggested that gravel may be an appropriate finish, especially if softened with planting at its edges.

Seating will be provided at the front of the shop, behind a small (750mm) retaining wall between the shop and forecourt, to accommodate the slight fall across the site.

The Panel was concerned that this change in level would necessitate a barrier on top of the wall, and we encouraged the design team to consider raising the ground floor level and thereby increase the ridge height slightly, in order to achieve a gentler slope and avoid a retaining wall.

The Panel welcomed the environmental objectives and commended the way in which the take-up of PVs, based on the funding currently available, had been adopted by other residents on the back of these proposals. We queried the actual low carbon performance of air source heat pumps, but accepted that they could work well with a renewable electricity source such as PV. We would like to see a lobbied entrance, to avoid excessive heat loss in the winter.

The Panel emphasised the importance of keeping materials natural and local, and suggested that this could be an opportunity to incorporate an element of community sourcing and self-build.

**Mae Panel Adolygu Dylunio Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a'r staff yn croesawu rhagor o ymgynghoriad, a bydd yn hapus i ddarparu rhagor o adborth am yr adroddiad yma a/neu lle bo'n briodol, dderbyn cyflwyniadau pellach. Diolch am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn a chadwch mewn cysylltiad â ni os gwelwch yn dda ynglŷn â hynt eich prosiect. A fyddech gystal â'n hysbysu o ddatblygiad eich prosiect. Diolch yn fawr am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn.**

The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel welcomes further consultation and we will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Please keep us informed of the progress of your project. Thank you for consulting the Commission.

*Mae copi iath Gymraeg o'r adroddiad hwn ar gael ar ofyn.  
A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.*

**Atodiad 1/appendix 1      Mynychwyr/attendees**

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr Agent/Client/Developer	Llanmadoc Community Shop Group (Ivor Williams)
Pensaer/Dylunydd Trefol Architectural/Urban Designer	Design Research Unit, WSA (Wayne Forster)
Ymgynghorwyr/Consultants	n/a
Trydydd Parti/Third Party	n/a
Awdurdod Cynllunio/Planning Authority	CC Swansea
Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/ Design Review Panel Cadeirydd/Chair Swydog/Officer Prif Banelydd/Lead Panellist	Ewan Jones Cindy Harris Roger Ayton Richard Parnaby Ashley Bateson Andrew Linfoot
Sylwedyddion/Observers	n/a