

Design Review Report

251 Cyncoed Road, Cardiff

DCFW Ref: N274

Desktop Review – February 2022



Review Status

Meeting date
Issue date
Scheme location
Scheme description
Scheme reference number
Planning status

PUBLIC

Desktop review February 2022
16th February 2022
Cardiff
Residential
N274
Pre-application

Declarations of Interest

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare ***in advance*** any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review and meeting Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCFW's central records.

None recorded.

Consultations to Date

This is the first time that the Design Commission for Wales has reviewed proposals for this site.

The Proposals

The information submitted to DCFW describes the site:

No. 251 is a detached bungalow with detached single garage to the west side of Cyncoed Road. The property sits at the northern end of a block defined by Llangorse Road to the north, Dan-y-Coed Road to the South and Duffryn Road to the West approximately 300m from Cyncoed Village centre. Cyncoed Road is characterised by a broad mixture of properties and ages, many of which have been altered over the last few decades. The detached bungalow is centrally located on the sloping plot with east facing front garden and driveway, and large west facing garden sitting at approximately 1m below internal floor level.

Main Points

Hiraith Architects is appointed to prepare designs for a large new family home on a site at 251 Cyncoed Road Cardiff. There is an existing single storey bungalow on the site that was constructed during the early stages of the development of the Cyncoed neighbourhood in the years before 1940.

The design has been developed in the form of an options appraisal that has been submitted to Cardiff City Council and to The Design Commission for Wales for comment prior to submitting a full planning application.

This note has been prepared by DCFW based on a review of documents submitted with particular reference made to a report entitled Supporting Information for Pre-Planning Advice.

The Supporting Information For Pre-Planning Advice includes.

- A description of the existing bungalow highlighting its out-dated and inconvenient layout and very poor environmental performance compared with even minimal modern standards.
- A review of the diverse style, character and form of the detached villas that make up the Cyncoed neighbourhood.
- The many diverse styles and forms of adaptations to and, in some instances, the wholesale replacements of houses that have occurred across the area.
- The client's brief for new family home built to high environmental standards both in its performance and construction.
- A very detailed analysis of many options for either replacing or extending and upgrading the existing property. This analysis is based on calculating the 'The Form Heatloss Factor' for various options. The analysis concluded that reducing the surface area of the building will result in less heat loss and therefore less insulation for a given heating input to achieve desirable comfort levels. A low FHF is therefore desirable according to this metric.
- Analysis of adjacent building heights
- Plan options for Ground level options C1 and C3 and first floor option C2 and C3
- Outline sketch elevations showing a flat roof two storey building that seems to relate to plan options C3
- The report states that the option of entirely replacing the existing building with new construction has been considered but rejected as it is considered that such an approach would increase the overall CO2 emissions burden from the project. However no calculations or evidence is provided to support this assertion. No drawings are shown of a new build approach.
- The preferred option seems to be option C3 that retains some small percentage of the existing structure. The commentary suggests that recycling construction materials from the existing house will be explored during design development.

Observations and comments by DCFW.

1 The proposed use of this land for a family home is entirely in keeping with the established use and is fully supported.

2 The DCFW strongly supports the client and architects desire to minimise the environmental impacts of the building both during construction and in use. A commitment to a target energy performance standard would reinforce and give weight to this generally stated commitment.

3 The DCFW is not convinced of the benefit of retaining the small percentage of the existing that is shown in option C3. The constraints imposed by this approach result in:

- A compromised and inefficient plan layout.
- The over dominance of the retained garage on the private garden area.
- Potential difficulties of joining old and new forms of construction – cold bridges – condensation etc.
- The 'Form Heat loss Factor of the C3 building compared with a more geometrically compact and simple approach that a new building might develop
- The VAT penalty of this approach.

4 The DCFW would suggest that the architect should give further thought to an entirely new build option that fully delivers to the clients brief and maximises the potential amenity

and delight of this large garden site offers. A new building combined with careful building material recycling might provide a more beneficial overall result.

5 The architectural form and appearance of the proposed building are drawn in line outline only. The drawing appears to show a flat roof building of a similar scale, but contrasting form, to the adjacent houses. Reference is made in the text to the work of Frank Lloyd Wright and other modernist master architects from Wales and elsewhere. This approach might be acceptable however the current outline drawings are not sufficiently developed to comment further at this stage.

Report prepared by Carole-Anne Davies, Chief Executive, DCFW

Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru Design Commission for Wales is the trading name of DCFW LIMITED, a Private Limited Company established under the Companies Act 1985 and 2006, Company No: 04391072 incorporated in England and Wales as a wholly owned subsidiary of the Welsh Government. Registered office: 4th Floor, Cambrian Buildings, Mount Stuart Square, Cardiff CF10 5FL T: 029 2045 1964 E connect@dcfw.org. The comment recorded in this report, arising from formal Design Review through our Design Review Service, is provided in the public interest for the consideration of local planning authorities as a material consideration, and other users of the Design Review Service. It is not and should not be considered 'advice' and no third party is bound or required to act upon it. The Design Review Service is delivered in line with DCFW's published protocols, code of conduct and complaints procedure, which should be read and considered by users of the service.

A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.