

Design Review Report

Caerphilly Castle Regeneration, Caerphilly

DCFW Ref: N244

Meeting of 12th November 2020

Review Status

Meeting date
Issue date
Scheme location
Scheme description
Scheme reference number
Planning status

PUBLIC

12th November 2020 20th November 2020 Caerphilly Visitor facilities N244 Pre-application

Declarations of Interest

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare *in advance* any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review and meeting Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCFW's central records.

Consultations to Date

This is the first time the scheme has been reviewed.

The Proposals

The proposals are for the refurbishment of the existing Great Hall, conversion of the existing visitor centre into a shop, a new café, visitor reception area, toilets, catering facilities, education space, staff accommodation, external terrace and play area, and visitor interpretation and improved accessibility across the site. The objective of improving connectivity to the town itself was also identified as aim.

Main Points

The ambition to improve the visitor experience to the castle, ensure greater inclusivity and improve environmental conditions are all welcomed and supported by the panel. A visit to the Grade I listed Scheduled Monument should be a joyful and life enhancing experience and of a world-class standard. The review raised a number of concerns about the evolution of the design and how it has been presented which are outlined below.

Design Concept

The design concept and vision for the proposed new building was not clear from the information provided. There are some key early, strategic decisions that need to be made about the type of building that is being proposed, where it should be located within the context of the castle, and its relationship with the town itself. For example, should the building appear light and temporary or solid and permanent? Should the building touch the castle wall or be separate from it? Should the building be similar to the existing visitor centre or different? What should be distinctive about this as Caerphilly Castle's visitor centre? What role could it play in better connecting with the town?

At this stage we would expect to see a more thorough site analysis, review of precedents (what are the qualities of other world-class castle visitor centres?), design concept and options. Without this information it is very difficult to interpret whether the building proposed is the best solution for the area, whether it truly meets the project objectives, and it is hard to see how this is a particular architectural response to the location and context.

Building Form

The rationale for the current form of the proposed building is not clear. It creates some awkward spaces between the building and the castle wall.

Further analysis of the arrival sequence would help to inform the design to test what is visible and ensure there is clear legibility for visitors. Currently the existing building which is becoming the shop will be most prominent on arrival, so the new building will need to counter this to ensure people know where to go.

Access and Interpretation

Interpretation and social accessibility seem to be progressing well but would benefit from being extended out beyond the castle grounds into the wider town centre. Physical access improvements across the site as a whole were not presented but will need to be developed as part of the landscape design.

Distribution of Uses

The arrangement of uses on the site does not yet seem to be fully resolved. Is this the optimum location to fulfil some of the wider objectives mentioned during the presentation? Are the toilets in the right place? Is the relationship between the café and play area right? Is there sufficient internal space for interpretation?

External Space

The intention to work with both the internal and external spaces is positive but could be further enhanced by ensuring both aspects interact well with each other. Appointing a landscape architect is critical to ensuring that the external space is designed in conjunction with the building and interpretation proposals.

Next Steps

The length of the presentation and some technical issues meant that there was not sufficient time to cover all aspects of the proposals in great detail (such as the Great Hall). We would welcome a further review of the proposals when further design development has taken place but well in advance of a planning application.

Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru Design Commission for Wales is the trading name of DCFW LIMITED, a Private Limited Company established under the Companies Act 1985 and 2006, Company No: 04391072 incorporated in England and Wales as a wholly owned subsidiary of the Welsh Government. Registered office: 4th Floor, Cambrian Buildings, Mount Stuart Square, Cardiff CF10 5FL T: 029 2045 1964 E connect@dcfw.org. The comment recorded in this report, arising from formal Design Review through our Design Review Service, is provided in the public interest for the consideration of local planning authorities as a material consideration, and other users of the Design Review Service. It is not and should not be considered 'advice' and no third party is bound or required to act

upon it. The Design Review Service is delivered in line with DCFW's published protocols, code of conduct and complaints procedure, which should be read and considered by users of the service.

A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.

Attendees

Agent/Client/Developer: Kate Roberts, Cadw

Stephen Jones, Cadw

Architect: David Burne, Purcell

Mabon Rhys Jones, Purcell

Project Manager: Amy Hands, Mace

Benn Allen-Gunn, Mace

Access and Interpretation: Ewan McCarthy, Bright

Local Planning Authority:

Chair: Kedrick Davies Lead Panellist: Neil Williamson

Design Review Panel: Michael Gwyther-Jones

Toby Adam

Jen Heal, Design Advisor, DCFW Efa Lois, Place Advisor, DCFW