

Statws/Status:
Cyfrinachol / Confidential



Adroddiad Adolygu Dylunio: Design Review Report:	29 July 2008
Dyddiad Cyfarfod / Meeting Date:	16 July 2008
Lleoliad/Location:	Sketty Lane Swansea
Disgrifiad o'r Cynllun Scheme Description:	Healthcare
Cleient/Asiant: Client/Agent:	Maggie's Centres [Sarah Beard, Pat Steane] ABM University NHS Trust [Fiona Edwards]
Developer/Datblygwr:	n/a
Pensaer/Architect:	Kisho Kurakawa Executive architects: Garbes and James [Wendy James, Thore Garber]
Awdurdod Cynllunio: Planning Authority:	CC Swansea
Statws Cynllunio: Planning Status:	Pre-application
Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/ Design Review Panel: Wendy Richards (cadeirydd/chair) Cindy Harris (swyddog/officer) Charlei Deng (swyddog/officer)	Ed Colgan Jonathan Adams Elfed Roberts Michael Griffiths Ashley Bateson
Lead Panellist:	Michael Griffiths

Cyflwyniad/Presentation

Garbes and James are the executive architects appointed to take forward Japanese architect Kurokawa's concept design. They have previously worked for architect Daniel Libeskind and particularly on his proposal for a Maggie's Centre in Cambridge, where unfortunately the site was withdrawn.

This site is on the north west corner of the grounds of Singleton Hospital, close to existing cancer treatment facilities. The woodland park of Sketty Lodge lies immediately to the north, and there are glimpses of views across Swansea Bay through trees to the south.

The building form responds to these views by sweeping down to a single low point at its north and south extremities. The curved concrete walls with embedded titanium plates will require a high degree of skill in their execution. This has been achieved on projects in Japan such as the Shiga Kogen Roman Art museum. The roof will be a zinc standing seam finish with curved skylights running the length of the building, allowing a constant movement of daylight through internal spaces. It is intended that ceilings will be striated timber and floor finishes will be cork.

The integrated project team is committed to achieving a high quality realisation of an inspirational design. The client has considerable expertise in developing similar centres, and the members of the team [including M&E consultant and Quantity Surveyor] have worked together on other Maggie's Centres.

The comments from the Local Authority mentioned the need to re-clad the sub-station and establish accessible gradients for pedestrians from the south. They expressed some concern about weathering of the exposed concrete.

Ymateb y Panel/Panel's Response

The Panel appreciated the way in which the building responds to the site, with relaxation rooms well placed to exploit the views out. We acknowledged that this is a small site and the existing buildings are in a poor state of repair. Nevertheless, we thought the approach to the Centre was well considered and the isolation of the remaining buildings was acceptable as they no longer serve a residential function.

The Panel thought that the landscape design was less well considered and noted that the majority of the pond to the west would be concealed behind the lift and service zones. We were informed that the plan has been amended to replace the pond with 'dry water', or fine white gravel, but the essential shape will be retained. The team will involve local horticultural expertise to advise on planting and opportunities for horticultural therapy will

be explored. The sub-station will be screened with a 'green wall' on its eastern elevation and a grassed mound to the south.

The Panel noted the steep steps on the southern pedestrian approach and would like to see a ramp as part of the landscape incorporated into the design. The team agreed, while pointing out that most people would be approaching from the treatment centres to the east, along a dedicated footpath running beside the grasscrete vehicular route. We advised that the direction of vehicles on this route should be revised to ensure that passengers were dropped off at the Centre on the correct side.

With regard to the proposed fair-faced concrete walls, the Panel noted that this is a very different climate from Japan and the effects of weathering do need to be considered. Also the build quality will be critical and the additional costs will be significant. The team stated that the procurement would be based on a 2 stage tender process followed by a traditional contract, and that the pre-qualification documentation should focus on evidence of delivery of similar quality construction. In addition, the executive architects have some experience in this area and knowledge of relevant expertise in the trade. We were informed that the budget for this 300 square metre building was £1.9m, excluding land and fees. The Panel commented that precast units manufactured off-site might prove more practical than in situ concrete, especially as the latter method would still require movement joints to be built in. It was confirmed that a smooth render finish was the fall back position.

The Panel raised the possible problem of unauthorised access onto the roof which curves down to meet the ground, but the client thought that this would not present a problem, and cited the Maggie's Centre in Fife, which also has a low roof and has not been abused. They believe that the buildings themselves engender respect, and pointed out that being on a hospital site ensures a measure of security. As they are already based on the site, Maggie's staff could confirm that they have not had any problems with anti-social behaviour.

The Panel welcomed the sustainability proposals, to use locally sourced sustainable materials, to maximise daylight penetration without excessive solar gain, and to develop a biomass based heating strategy. We noted that the internal finish materials were more compatible with these aims than the external concrete and zinc. We thought it would be important to ensure that the wood-burning stove was appropriately sized to meet the demand, and was compatible with underfloor heating delivery.

Crynodb/Summary

The Panel greatly welcomes the opportunity to comment on this exciting and innovative proposal, which we think responds well to the brief and the site. We are very supportive of the ethos behind the Maggie's Centres, and think

that this project will greatly expand the range of care available to patients, as well as providing the area with a building of architectural merit. We think there are minor issues which remain to be resolved:

- We think the landscape design needs to be developed and we are pleased to learn that local horticultural advice will be sought
- We understand that the fair faced concrete is an essential part of the design, but we do have concerns both about the effects of weathering and the feasibility of achieving the necessary quality of construction. We think that pre-cast concrete units may be the best option.
- In general the external works and access layout is well considered, but we advise that vehicles are routed so that passengers can alight next to the building.
- We note that there may be a problem with unauthorised access on to the low level roof.
- We applaud the sustainability aspirations and look forward to the delivery of an exemplar in this field.

Diwedd/End

NB A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.