

# Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio

## Design Review Report

### **DATGANIADAU O DDIDDORDEB**

Mae gofyn i aelodau o'r Panel, arsyllwyr a phartion perthnasol eraill ddatgan unrhyw ddiddordebau sydd ganddynt **ymlaen llaw** mewn perthynas â'r eitemau Panel Adolygu Dylunio Bydd unrhyw ddatganiadau o'r fath yn cael eu cofnodi yma ac yng nghofnodion canolog Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

### **DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS**

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare ***in advance*** any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCfW's central records.

### **Statws adolygu/Review status**

### **Cyhoedd/Public**

Dyddiad cyfarfod/meeting date	23 May 2011
Dyddiad cyhoeddi/issue date	31 May 2011
Lleoliad y cynllun/scheme location	Llandeilo Provisions Market
Disgrifiad y cynllun/scheme description	Mixed use
Statws cynllunio/planning status	Full application made Jan 2011
Datganiadau o ddiddordeb/declaration of interests	None

### **Cyflwyniad/Presentation**

- 1.1 This scheme involves the refurbishment and conversion of a 19<sup>th</sup> century (1838) Grade II listed Provisions Market building and the development of 13 new residential units on adjacent land. The scheme was first devised in 2007 following a development brief from Carmarthenshire County Council. The Provisions Market building has been unused for some time and the land now houses a recycling facility and is used adhoc for parking. The adjacent townscape context comprises terraced residential streets, with a number of properties of individual architectural merit, now listed, within a Conservation Area.
- 1.2 A full planning application was submitted in January 2011 following pre-application discussion with the Local Authority (LA). The developer also hosted a public exhibition in April 2011 to consult local residents on the proposed development.
- 1.3 The refurbishment proposal for the Provisions Market seeks to protect the existing structure and preserve its character, appearance and fabric. It will be refurbished in order to provide a shell for future use. No end users have yet been identified however three configurations for the internal space are included in the Planning & Listed Building application.

- 1.4 The refurbishment Provisions Market will restore the original form and fabric, and upgrade the existing glass roof lantern, to maximise natural light. It will retain the additional entrance, created when the market was used as a fire station, and utilise the entrance opening onto the new public square, to enhance the use of the square. New residential accommodation adjoining the Provisions Market defines the perimeter of the square and contributes to the active frontage. The developer anticipates using materials already used on site to maintain the character of the building.
- 1.5 The residential block proposed creates a small public square between the market and the planned new dwellings, which complete the residential terrace, North Bank. An open aspect has been retained to the rear of North Bank terrace by providing parking and amenity space for the new development, retaining wide views for existing residents. The developer also indicated that the planting proposed would accommodate existing and new habitats for wildlife (bats, swifts etc).
- 1.6 The sustainability strategy in respect of the new residential scheme will achieve a minimum of Code for Sustainable Homes Level 3, focussing on energy efficiency, possibly using Combined Heat and Power (CHP) technology.
- 1.7 Initial repair work to the Provisions Market has a budget allocation of £500,000 with the new build budgeted at just above £1m. The cost of the internal conversion of the Provisions Market has yet to be determined and will be dependent on end user requirements.
- 1.8 The LA has some concerns regarding the development proposals. They remain to be convinced that the scheme preserves or enhances the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and have concerns that the design, scale and materials are inappropriate for the setting, alongside the listed former Provisions Market building, opposite the listed former National School and School House and at a prominent location within the Conservation Area.
- 1.9 The provision of informal parking on and around the site is a concern for local residents who currently enjoy this facility without regulation. There are questions about the level of parking required to serve the refurbished market hall and the residential proposals.
- 1.10 The public consultation exercise clearly indicated that whilst many local residents were in favour of refurbishing the Provisions Market the absence of an end user was a concern.

**Crynodeb o'r prif bwyntiau a gododd o'r drafodaeth, i'w darllen ochr yn ochr ag Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn.**

**Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.**

- 2.1 The Panel agreed this was a very interesting scheme on a challenging site, but considered that there was a lack of detailed contextual information in the

Design and Access Statement (DAS). The Panel considered there to be major issues as yet unresolved in the development proposal, namely:

- Whilst the development adopted a sensitive approach to the Provisions Market building, the architectural solution for the residential block was not as well considered. Earlier scheme proposals demonstrated a more sensitive solution to the development of the site and these should be reviewed.
- A physical model or photomontage is needed to include the adjacent townscape context and demonstrate a clear response to the architecture and massing of the Conservation Area.
- Sections through the site and existing/proposed level changes need to be clearly demonstrated.
- Options for parking for both the Provisions Market and residential development need to be explored but kept to a minimum.

## **Adran 2/part 2      Trafodaeth ac Ymateb y Panel yn Llawn Discussion and panel response in full**

- 3.1 The Panel considers the existing architecture of Llandeilo to be rich, bold and colourful, mainly of Georgian/Victorian style with details of brickwork and coloured render. The Panel was not convinced that the proposals were a sensitive response to the context of the town.
- 3.2 The Panel was disappointed that there was no street elevation demonstrating how proposals completed North Bank terrace, or how the residential block sat within the context of the townscape, directly adjacent to the terrace and the Provisions Market. The fenestration details for the new build along North Bank terrace and overlooking the public square were considered inappropriate to the context of the site.
- 3.4 A new town square adjacent to the Provisions Market and forming an entrance to the residential development was a positive contribution to the proposals, enabling the designers to provide inclusive and accessible parking provision for both developments.
- 3.5 The Panel felt the architecture was compromised because the plan was more complex than some of the earlier design development schemes, but thought that the avoidance of developing the rear of North Bank was positive, and understood that the difference in levels between the rear of North Bank and the rear of the market hall made developing this area complex.

**Mae Panel Adolygu Dylunio Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a'r staff yn croesawu rhagor o ymgynghoriad, a bydd yn hapus i ddarparu rhagor o adborth am yr adroddiad yma a/neu lle bo'n briodol, dderbyn cyflwyniadau pellach. Diolch am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn a chadwch mewn cysylltiad â ni os gwelwch yn dda ynglŷn â hynt eich prosiect. A fyddech gystal â'n hysbysu o ddatblygiad eich prosiect. Diolch yn fawr am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn.**

**The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel welcomes further consultation and we will be happy to provide further feedback on this report**

**and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Please keep us informed of the progress of your project. Thank you for consulting the Commission.**

***Mae copi iath Gymraeg o'r adroddiad hwn ar gael ar ofyn.  
A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.***

**Atodiad 1/appendix 1      Mynychwyr/attendees**

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr  
Agent/Client/Developer

Grwp Gwalia  
Elfed Roberts/Jo Margetts

Pensaer/Dylunydd Trefol  
Architectural/Urban Designer

PCKO Architects  
Andrew Ogorzalek  
Paul Webb

Ymgynghorwyr/Consultants

Trydydd Parti/Third Party

Awdurdod Cynllunio/Planning Authority

Carmarthenshire County Council  
Graham Noakes

Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/Design Review Panel  
Cadeirydd/Chair  
Prif Banelydd/Lead Panellist

Wendy Richards  
Chris Jones  
Simon Carne  
David Harvey  
Jonathan Hines  
Sue Jones

Sylwedyddion/Observers

Gayna Jones DCfW Commissioner