

Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

Review Status: **Confidential**

Meeting date:	20th May 2009
Issue Date:	1st June 2009
Scheme Location:	Barry Waterfront
Scheme Description:	Mixed use
Planning Status:	Pre-application

Part1: Presentation

This scheme has been previously reviewed by DCFW in May 08 and December 08. An outline planning application will be submitted in July 09. The consortium behind this proposal remains committed to delivering a commercially viable development based on a phased approach. Since the last review, work has been done to develop character areas, with West Pond being mainly family housing with larger gardens, and South Quay predominantly apartments with smaller gardens, mews courts and rising to three storeys.

The design team sought advice from the Panel on how far to go with the detailed design at this stage. They have sought to vary the Vale's guidelines on public open space, adopting a more urban, rather than suburban, approach.

The Local Authority representative stated that the Development Principles SPG document would be going to cabinet on 3rd June and was now a more flexible statement, based on consensus. The Vale have been involved in the preparation of the Development Brief and would have preferred to consult on that before the submission of a planning application. It is considered essential that the Mole is included in the application site. The Local Authority have serious concerns about the large retail scheme, and associated parking and filling station.

Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.

The Panel understands the current economic constraints and views this scheme as an important test of how successful mixed use development can be achieved in these circumstances. The active engagement of the Local Authority is crucial to ensure a comprehensive and flexible approach, and the Panel was pleased to see that the

Development Brief had been advanced significantly. We would like to see the full Design & Access statement before a planning application is made and in the meantime, we would make the following points:

- The masterplan is progressing well but needs to be strengthened, with a clear public realm and connectivity strategy that extends beyond the site boundaries to make the all-important links to station, town and Island. Clear design guidelines and parameters need to be set.
- The basic site layout appears convincing, but there is a very limited typology of residential development and consequent danger of monotony and lack of tenure and affordability mix, especially in the hands of volume builders.
- Our main concern is with the effect of the district centre on the quality of future development and public space. While we recognize that this is a critical part of the phasing and essential for future residential development, this first phase must lay the groundwork for a future vibrant 'hub' of genuine mixed uses and active public realm.
- The energy strategy should be determined as soon as possible and used to inform the site layout. CSH and BREEAM standards should be set not at current levels, but at levels that would be expected by the time of development.
- We support the development of the linear park and would like to see a green connection and walk/cycle way across the railway to Barry Harbour delivered in the first phase.

Part 2: Discussion and Panel Response in Full

The Design and Access statement which will form part of the planning application will need to explain and justify the development of the proposal so far, and include parameters for aspects such as scale, density and uses. The Panel noted that there were difficulties in providing tree planting in large parts of the West Pond and East Dock. It is important that the drawings accurately illustrate design intentions and the constraints of the site are clearly described in the Design and Access statement.

The public realm and connectivity strategy needs strengthening and embedding into the documents. Reference should be made to the potential for a future marina together with provision for its successful integration. Temporary uses that can take advantage of the recreational potential of the water should be sought to assist regeneration. Views of the proposed development from medium and long distance vantage points should be included.

The Panel had strong concerns about the impact of the proposed 'district centre', which had become a 70-90,000 sqm superstore with a large triangular car park, thereby creating a large void in what was otherwise a fairly dense urban grain. The impact of the car park would be exacerbated by the inclusion of a filling station on a key frontage. As the first phase of development, this would bring in the necessary receipts to provide the infrastructure for residential development (principally the extension of the main road through the site). However, the Panel understood the Local Authority's concerns that it sets a very unfortunate precedent for the development of the area. The placement of the supermarket to front the key pedestrian link across the site (from the Station to the Mole) is a positive move, but there is a need to protect its integrity from trolley storage and other supermarket appendages, and to ensure strong landscaping and design of the public realm.

The intention to ensure active ground floor uses like the cafe along this frontage was welcomed but needs to be carefully conditioned. Other active uses will not be appended to the supermarket but will face the waterfront where they will become a focus of activity.

The developer stated that the retail operator has endorsed these objectives and that there will be strict design guidelines contained in the sale contract. Use of the car park will not be restricted to shoppers by the retailer. The developer was encouraged to consider breaking up the large parking area into smaller parking lots, and to designate some areas for other uses such as local markets.

Changes have been made to the block layout in West Pond to make better use of solar orientation, but the layout on South Quay remains oriented to the east and west. The overshadowing effect of the cliff face to the south negated north/south orientation to a certain extent, while the short streets running down to the water give most residents some water views, and create the opportunity for green streets and homezones.

More work had been done to improve the green corridor as a feature and this was welcomed, though some of the detailed layout at the western end needed more discussion, as did the rationale and design of the new park on the southern edge of the site. The suggestion that townhouses that fronted the water north of the Mole might have ground floor car parking was disappointing in the extreme, and the Panel urged the design team to ensure that all walkways and quaysides had inhabited ground floors with private, semi-private or communal landscaped areas.

The sustainability strategy provides for Code for Sustainable Homes Level 3 initially and will include solar water heating. Future provision for Code 4 will add solar photovoltaics. A CHP district heating scheme will be fuelled by mains gas initially but could convert to biomass in the future, and the developer is in touch with potential energy supply companies. We advised that an integrated sustainability strategy should be determined urgently as part of the planning application and should inform the space planning and site layout. We noted that solar water heating would not be compatible with a CHP district heating system. As residential development is forecast to begin in 2011, we would expect to see higher Code Levels required by the Local Authority. The development of a transport strategy is ongoing and will be included in the Design & Access statement.

The phasing strategy will need to be agreed by all partners. Currently it is planned to install the road network to include the supermarket, West Pond and the new primary school only. The Local Authority would prefer to see the whole of the new road delivered in the first phase.

The Panel was concerned that the park on the East Quay site was unlikely to be a successful public space with its lack of enclosure and natural surveillance, protection from the main road, or focus of pedestrian routes.

The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel and staff welcome further consultation and will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations where more time could be devoted to the masterplan itself. Thank you for consulting the Commission and please keep in touch with us about the progress of your project.

A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.

Appendix 1: Attendees

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr: Agent/Client/Developer	Consortium comprising Persimmon Homes, Taylor Wimpey and Barratt Homes [Richard Keogh]
Pensaer/Architect:	Holder Mathias Architects [Stephen Hill]
Consultants:	Soltys Brewster [Simon Brewster] CDN Planning [Kedrick Davies]
AwdurdodCynllunio/ Planning Authority	Vale of Glamorgan [Steve Ball, John Dent]
Y Panel Adlygu Dylunio: Design review panel: John Punter [Chair] Cindy Harris [Officer] Simon Carne	Michael Griffiths Ashley Bateson Roger Ayton
Lead Panellist:	Simon Carne