

Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

DATGANIADAU O DDIDDORDEB

Mae gofyn i aelodau o'r panel, arsyllwyr a phartion perthnasol eraill ddatgan unrhyw ddi-ddordebau sydd ganddynt **ymlaen llaw** mewn perthynas â'r eitemau Panel Adolygu Dylunio Bydd unrhyw ddatganiadau o'r fath yn cael eu cofnodi yma ac yng nghofnodion canolog Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS

Panel members, observers and other relevant parties are required to declare **in advance** any interests they may have in relation to the Design Review Agenda items. Any such declarations are recorded here and in DCfW's central records.

Statws adolygu/Review status

Cyfrinachol/Confidential

Dyddiad cyfarfod/meeting date	4th May 2011
Dyddiad cyhoeddi/issue date	18th May 2011
Lleoliad y cynllun/scheme location	Triangle site, Barry
Disgrifiad y cynllun/scheme description	Hotel
Statws cynllunio/planning status	Pre-application
Datganiadau o ddi-ddordeb/declaration of interests	None

Adran 1/part 1

Cyflwyniad/Presentation

The Triangle site is part of the Innovation Quarter at Barry Waterfront, within the Special Regeneration Area designated by the Welsh Assembly Government (WAG). A previous application for a Learning Centre on this site was reviewed by DCfW in September 2008. A Design Brief for the Innovation Quarter (IQ) published in 2010 identifies this site for use as a hotel / restaurant.

A crucial starting point for the design development was to provide a tangible link to the nearby listed Pump House building. This has been done using the scale of the proposed new hotel building (3 storeys), materials (brick and metal cladding), and articulation of the elevations. The Brewers Fayre restaurant is located in a separate building of 1-2 storeys facing south on to Ffordd y Mileniwm, and is based on an optimised floor plan which is a client requirement. Elevational materials include brick, render and timber panels. A landscape architect has been engaged to work on the public open spaces facing the roundabout to the south west, and between the two buildings.

An existing petrol interceptor limits development on the south west corner of the site. It was noted that the current road layout adjacent to the site is subject to alteration, and may become a traffic light junction in the future. Pre-application discussions have been held with the local authority, who have focussed their comments on the need for an outward looking scheme which enhances the public realm and relates well to its surroundings.

Crynodeb o'r prif bwyntiau a gododd o'r drafodaeth, i'w darllen ochr yn ochr ag Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn.

Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.

The Panel was pleased to see the latest proposal for this site at an early stage. While we appreciate the difficulties presented by the business model and the site constraints, and we acknowledge that the architect has worked to get the best solution from the brief, we think that major issues remain to be resolved. In summary:

- We recognise the positive features of the scheme, such as the contextual response, an agreement to limit the palette of materials, the lack of a security fence, the involvement of a landscape architect and the commitment to BREEAM Excellent.
- However, we have serious concerns about the current site layout which results in a weak street frontage and suburban architectural response to the south.
- We think that greater priority should be given to the dockside frontage and a stronger and more continuous street presence created, as required in the IQ Design Brief. This would involve re-visiting the location, form and scale of buildings.
- A more formal composition and elevational treatment should be considered, along with a review of the entrance location and a physical link between the buildings.
- Materials should be robust, simple and well detailed, with some dockside references.
- The stair towers on the hotel should be reduced in height, in deference to the Pump House chimney.
- The location of external play spaces needs to be considered, ideally away from the road, and be integrated with the rest of the site.
- The public art budget should be used to engage an artist to work with the design team to incorporate artwork within the developing design for the site as a whole.
- We would like to see parking provision capped at the minimum level acceptable to the developer.
- Likely desire lines across the site should be used as an opportunity to enhance and civilise the rear car park.

- Drawings and plans submitted for a planning application should include more information on the site context and wider sections of the site and surroundings.
- Any renewable energy measures likely to affect the roofscape should be made explicit on the drawings.

Adran 2/part 2

Trafodaeth ac Ymateb y Panel yn Llawn Discussion and panel response in full

This is an exposed site and the Panel questioned the provision of public open space, next to a major road and facing the prevailing winds. The proposed relationship with the roundabout may not be appropriate in the longer term. While we appreciated that seating areas for diners would be provided immediately outside the restaurant, we thought it was important to define the nature and uses of the focal point on the south west corner, and to ensure a high quality landscape treatment which would withstand harsh conditions. We did not think that a single piece of artwork on this corner 'plaza' would be appropriate and we would prefer to see the '1% for art' budget used to engage a public artist who could integrate artwork with the building design and landscape strategy as a whole.

Given the reference in the IQ design brief to the objective of 'creating well defined streets, spaces and building frontages', it is unfortunate that the whole development is set back from the site boundary. Ideally we would have liked to see the south west corner reinforced with a strong built form, although we accept that this is unlikely in view of the petrol interceptor constraint.

An alternative approach to strengthening the street frontage of Ffordd y Mileniwm might be to move the restaurant building further east and south, and consider an increase in its scale. This would help to close off views of the car park and deter unofficial access. Joining the two relocated buildings together would then reinforce and prioritise the street frontage to the south and lessen the impression of a piecemeal, suburban development. There would be an opportunity to take better advantage of views to the south and the docks, especially if first floor dining was available behind a largely glazed facade. However, it became apparent in discussion that the requirement for a fixed footprint and layout for the restaurant building was unlikely to change or to become sufficiently flexible to allow for a contextual design response. A setback on the restaurant building would be necessary to allow for outside seating, irrespective of the existing building line. We thought that all toilets should be located on the ground floor, for ease of access for all customers and to avoid any distinction between disabled and standard provision.

The Panel thought that the hotel building was better resolved and acknowledged the way in which the built form responded to existing buildings to the north west and the important access route of Hood Road. However, the proposed form creates the expectation of a main entrance at the 'hinge', which is confusing and does not help the legibility of the approach. We would like to see a simple elevational treatment which is both industrial and contemporary, emphasising the solidity of the brickwork

with good detailing and avoiding the use of metal cladding. A limited palette of materials should nevertheless relate to the dockside location, possibly with the use of 'chunky timber'. The stair towers should be reduced in height, so as not to appear to be competing with the Pump House chimney.

The Panel had concerns about the environmental quality of the rear car park, and the impact of vehicular traffic and service deliveries on the adjacent residential properties to the east. We were told that the boundary planting to the east will be enhanced, and that an attractive appearance to the service yard is required by the client, as this is often the first impression for customers arriving by car. In our view the parking numbers should be capped at 119, which the developer has indicated could be acceptable (depending on the transport statement). The reduction in numbers would then allow for some enhancement of the space and mitigation of the inevitable impacts.

The bus layby on the southern boundary is a requirement of the local authority and would form part of a public transport route serving the new waterfront development. The Panel thought that a new desire line was bound to be created from the bus stop across the car park to the college building further north, and this should be accommodated in the layout and landscaping of the car park.

The Panel was pleased to learn that a BREEAM pre-assessment had been carried out and the team are confident of gaining the required Excellent rating. It was confirmed that there would be a single heating/cooling plant for both buildings, which would be more efficient given the complementarity of uses over a 24 hour period. Solar panels will probably be located on a south facing roof, and it is important that their location is identified on the plans, and their impact on the elevational appearance is assessed as part of the planning application.

Mae Panel Adolygu Dylunio Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru a'r staff yn croesawu rhagor o ymgynghoriad, a bydd yn hapus i ddarparu rhagor o adborth am yr adroddiad yma a/neu lle bo'n briodol, dderbyn cyflwyniadau pellach. Diolch am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn a chadwch mewn cysylltiad â ni os gwelwch yn dda ynglŷn â hynt eich prosiect. A fyddech gystal â'n hysbysu o ddatblygiad eich prosiect. Diolch yn fawr am ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn.

The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel welcomes further consultation and we will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Please keep us informed of the progress of your project. Thank you for consulting the Commission.

***Mae copi iath Gymraeg o'r adroddiad hwn ar gael ar ofyn.
A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.***

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr
Agent/Client/Developer

Premier Inns Ltd

Pensaer/Dylunydd Trefol
Architectural/Urban Designer

Axiom Architects (Neil Way)

Ymgynghorwyr/Consultants

Walsingham Planning
(Stephen Brooker)

Trydydd Parti/Third Party

n/a

Awdurdod Cynllunio/Planning Authority

Vale of Glamorgan Council
(Steve Ball, Mark White)

Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/Design Review Panel
Alan Francis, Cadeirydd/Chair
Cindy Harris Swydog/Officer
Mark Hallett
Lynne Sullivan
Phil Roberts
Gerard Ryan

Prif Banelydd/Lead Panellist

Phil Roberts

Sylwedyddion/Observers

Kevin Woodward
(UWE, placement student)