

**Statws/Status:**  
**Cyfrinachol / Confidential**



|  |   |
|--|---|
| <b>Adroddiad Adolygu Dylunio:<br/>Design Review Report:</b>                          | <b>14 February 2006</b>   |
| <b>Dyddiad Cyfarfod / Cyflwyno'r Deunydd:<br/>Meeting Date / Material Submitted:</b> | <b>1 February 2006</b>  |
| <b>Lleoliad/Location:</b>  | <b>Mountstuart Square,<br/>Cardiff Bay</b>  |
| <b>Disgrifiad o'r Cynllun<br/>Scheme Description:</b>                                | <b>Refurbishment for mixed use</b>  |
| <b>Cynllunio:<br/>Consultants:</b>   | <b>Burroughs Consulting<br/>Engineers [Ian Jones]</b>                                       |
| <b>Cleient/Asiant:<br/>Client/Agent:</b>   | <b>Macob Projects Ltd<br/>[Phil Morgan]</b>   |
| <b>Pensaer/Architect:</b>  | <b>Aukett Fitzroy Robinson<br/>[Raul Curiel, Peter Bird,<br/>Jeremy Blake, Geoff Cohen]</b> |
| <b>Awdurdod Cynllunio:<br/>Planning Authority:</b>                                   | <b>Cardiff CC<br/>[Viv Williams]</b>  |
| <b>Statws Cynllunio:<br/>Planning Status:</b>  | <b>Pre-planning</b>   |
| <b>Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/Design Review Panel:</b>                                  |   |
| <b>Alan Francis (cadeirydd/chair)</b>  | <b>Paul Vanner</b>  |
| <b>Cindy Harris (swyddog/officer)</b>  | <b>Jonathan Adams</b>   |
| <b>Ben Sibert</b>  | <b>Douglas Hogg</b>   |
| <b>Ed Colgan</b>   |   |
| <b>Lead Panellist:</b>   | <b>Douglas Hogg</b>   |

**Sylwedyddion/Observers:**

**Charlie Deng**  
**Design Review assistant**

### **Cyflwyniad/Presentation**

The Coal Exchange is a historic building, the vast part of which has lain dormant for many years, and consequently a structural analysis has been carried out to identify any problematic areas due to water penetration, fire or external decay. This, together with an analysis of the architectural character of the elevations, established integrity on all but the western elevation.

One aim of this proposal is to reanimate Mountstuart Square and establish good street frontages, especially as the closed ends of the square do not encourage active uses. The existing forecourt car park and ramps will be demolished and a south facing courtyard will be reinstated in front of the building with a semicircle of steps accessing the lower ground level and surrounded by cafes and restaurants. Lower ground floor car parking remains, accessed from the north side.

The external envelope will be retained and restored with the exception of the central part of the western facade. This will be redesigned to suit the new uses and redefine the street edge. The roofscape will reintroduce its prominent corners and central features and the small hipped elements will be repeated behind defined and contained parapet lines. New roof forms are shown in the centre of the west and north elevations.

Internally, the central area of the Exchange Hall and its ancillary accommodation will be preserved and enhanced. The internal lightwells will be enlarged and the walls rebuilt to form a bigger courtyard, for the amenity of residential units and to provide circulation space. Elsewhere, demolition behind the facades will provide 129 new apartments including duplexes, with retail uses at ground and lower ground floors.

Most servicing will be done via the car park and a goods lift. Refuse will be stored in the basement and collected from street entrances. There will be two service cores to the east and west.

The Local Authority is pleased to see proposals to renovate this Grade 2\* listed building, which is in desperate need of restoration. They accept that a radical approach is necessary and they have raised no objections to removing part of the existing west wall. They are content with the mix of uses, subject to a Section 106 agreement. Details concerning the articulation and use of materials are still to be agreed. The design approach to the southern frontage and associated open space is welcomed.

### **Ymateb y Panel/Panel's Response**

The Panel was pleased to see these proposals which would save and restore to use this important historic building. In particular, we were delighted to see the proposed demolition of the car park walls, terraces and porch, and the creation of a new public forecourt. However, the disabled access lift forms an off centre feature and should be relocated and/or redesigned to respect the formality of the forecourt. We were informed that the balcony above the courtyard and the linking steps will be edged with a stone plinth and balustrading

to a height of 400-500mm with metalwork above. The Panel was not shown any details of this, but we believe the design of these elements to be critical to the success of the new forecourt. We wondered whether the intention was to replicate the traditional detailing or to introduce a more contemporary lightweight solution.

We accepted that these interventions should encourage the reanimation of the square, although we had reservations about the feasibility of al fresco dining in this location. In this context we thought that trees might provide unwelcome shading and suggested that the forecourt be treated as more of an urban space. We suggested that the degree of slope could be increased to minimise the number of steps.

The Panel welcomed the mix of uses and the principle of replacing the west elevation, as well as the faithful restoration of the other elevations. We supported the increased height of the corner pavilions with mansard roofs, and the retention or replacement of chimneys. It was suggested that the new west elevation could be given a fresher, less familiar treatment, possibly with a lighter metallic infill which would be unconstrained by the stone panels. The Panel noted the unfortunate location of the ground floor at pedestrian eye level, which rendered most of the street frontage quite hostile, and suggested that the car park and ground floor levels could both be lowered and staggered

On the east elevation, the rubblestone ground floor gives an opportunity for more street level access. Provision should be made for disabled access on the north east corner. With regard to the main south facade, the door and surrounding details on the west side of the forecourt should be reinstated, and the main entrance should be faithfully restored, as should the ironwork on top of the central pavilion roof.

The environmental benefits of reusing a good quality building were acknowledged. It was confirmed that residential units will have high standards of insulation and air tightness, although heating will be via individual boilers. The car park will be naturally ventilated and the parking ratio of 70 spaces to 129 apartments, was welcomed. Overall there will be less traffic than if the whole building was developed for B1 use, but the Panel would not like to see any increase in traffic leading to a traffic light junction at the entrance to the square.

The railings to the basement area should not reproduce the 1970s design, and hopefully an original design could be used as a pattern for new ones. The designers confirmed that windows would have the same proportion and position in the openings as the originals, and be made from timber on the retained elevations. All roof plant will be hidden in roofed-over valleys, although the Panel was unsure how ventilation to rooftop chillers etc could be maintained in such an arrangement. The demolition and construction would be done in one phase.

### **Crynodeb/Summary**

The Panel greatly welcomes this presentation and supports the principle of refurbishment into a mixed use scheme, combining respect for the original with newly created elements. We consider this to be an acceptable response to the brief and the site, with minor revisions only. In particular:

- We accept that the current west facade is redundant and should be replaced with a newly designed elevation and roof form

- The design of the west elevation needs further development. The ground floor level should be lowered and staggered if possible.
- We very much welcome the demolition of the added car park walls and terraces and the opening up the lower ground floor with sociable uses.
- We support all attempts to reanimate the square, provide active frontages and extend pedestrian use.
- The new public forecourt should be treated as an urban open space with minimal shading, and care needs to be taken in the detailing of the entrance balcony and stairs
- We would like to see the disabled access relocated and the details of the front entrance and forecourt facades in particular faithfully reproduced.
- We welcome the natural ventilation of the car park, but would like to see consideration of a group heating system.

**Diwedd/End**

**NB A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.**