

Addroddiad Adolygu Dylunio Design Review Report

Review Status: **Public**

Meeting date:	18th March 2009
Issue Date:	31st March 2009
Scheme Location:	Bayscape, Watkiss Way, Cardiff
Scheme Description:	Mixed use
Planning Status:	Outline application submitted September 2008

Part1: Presentation

The site is the existing boatyard for Cardiff Marine, on the north bank of the River Ely and next to the proposed Pont y Werin footbridge. It is allocated for residential development in the Local Plan and is the subject of a resolution to consent for an earlier scheme of 192 apartments in two 15 storey blocks.

The design team view this as a gateway site which will be highly visible when approaching from the PDR to the west and the Cogan Spur to the south west. They argue that a tall building with a minimum 25 storeys is necessary to establish a presence and act as a 'marker' for the International Sports Village and the Bay. The proposal is for a 30 storey tower and 4 smaller blocks, to accommodate a 155 bed hotel, 105 residential units and 1690 sqm of commercial floorspace.

The planning authority initially had significant reservations, and questioned the siting of what would be the tallest building in Cardiff, particularly in relation to the lack of public transport facilities. It was considered to be an overdevelopment of the site. More recently, in the Authority's view, the scheme has improved greatly, with a more rational layout and reduced floorspace.

Summary of key points arising from discussion, to be read in conjunction with Part 2 of this report.

The Panel welcomed this presentation although we would have preferred to see the proposal at pre-application stage. We have serious concerns about the scale and quantum of development proposed, particularly in relation to the impact on Penarth. Moreover, we are not convinced of the deliverability of this scheme, especially given the high quality of finishes we were shown. In summary:

- We do not accept the argument that a 30 storey tower is necessary to create presence and legibility.
- The proposed high quality of details and finishes will need to be well protected, in view of the D&B procurement process and the economics of delivery.
- BREEAM and Code ratings should be defined prior to consent being granted, and with advice from the Local Authority.
- Microclimatic issues of wind protection, solar shading and daylight access need to be resolved with the help of modelling.
- The mixed use and active frontages on the riverside are strongly supported.

Part 2: Discussion and Panel Response in Full

The Panel did have concerns about the scale of the tower, particularly given its location on the narrowest part of the river and its proximity to and impact on Penarth Haven. We do not agree that this scale is absolutely necessary for a quality development on this site, nor is it the only way to achieve good legibility. A greater flexibility is needed, especially as this is the element that is likely to arouse most opposition. Although the site is small for the quantum of development, it includes land which the developer has agreed to purchase which extends the area of the boatyard by 50%.

The commercial viability of this scheme is highly questionable, especially given the hotel layout of 5 to 8 bedrooms per floor, and the high level restaurant with the associated problems of access and servicing. The developer nevertheless believes that it is deliverable 2-3 years hence, and stressed that the project so far had been based on sound commercial advice.

The BREEAM / CSH rating for the scheme is not fixed and will depend on negotiations with the operator[s]. However, important microclimatic issues need to be addressed at this stage. The wind tunnel effect, especially around the smaller blocks, is likely to be significant and should be mitigated by the built form or possibly by planting. The western glazed elevations will need appropriate shading and this is unlikely to be achieved by brises soleil or fritted glass. Modelling is needed to ensure that the shading is effective and that sufficient daylight reaches the lower floors of the residential blocks – which looks unlikely on the model. 'Eco stations' will be provided throughout the development, as amenity spaces and to recycle grey water.

The proposed mixed use is welcomed, as well the location of some commercial units on the riverside walkway. Timber decks will conceal the edge of the car park and cascade down to the water. There may need to be more open space allocation at the junction of the walkway and the footbridge.

Parking is provided at a ratio of 1:1 for the residential units plus 21 visitor spaces and 40+ spaces for the hotel. Spaces will not be specifically allocated, so it should be possible to dovetail daytime and evening uses, but this will need adequate management. In addition 120 cycle storage spaces are provided. The team stated that there are 8 bus stops within 400m, a water taxi stop on the site, and Cogan railway station will become easily

accessible across the new bridge. We did not accept the supporting argument for the density, namely that this would become a public transport hub.

The Design Commission for Wales Design Review Panel and staff welcome further consultation and will be happy to provide further feedback on this report and/or where appropriate, to receive further presentations. Thank you for consulting the Commission and please keep in touch with us about the progress of your project.

A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.

Appendix 1: Attendees

Asiant/Client/Datblygwr: Agent/Client/Developer	Cardiff Marine Group [Chris Odling-Smee, Drew McDonald]
Pensaer/Architect:	Custard Architecture [Roy McCarthy, Alex d'Aubroy]
Consultants:	RPS [Simon Warder] Rummey Design [Robert Rummey]
AwdurdodCynllunio/ Planning Authority	Cardiff CC [Nigel Hanson]
Y Panel Adlygu Dylunio: Design review panel: Wendy Richards [Chair] Cindy Harris [Officer] Lynne Sullivan	Simon Carne Richard Parnaby Ann-Marie Smale Lyn Owen
Lead Panellist:	Ann-Marie Smale
Sylwedyddion/Observers:	David Harvey [DCFW Panellist]