

Statws/Status:

Cyfrinachol / Confidential

DESIGN
COMMISSION
FOR WALES
COMISIWN
DYLUNIO
CYMRU

Adroddiad Adolygu Dylunio: Design Review Report:	17 May 2005
Dyddiad Cyfarfod / Cyflwyno'r Deunydd: Meeting Date / Material Submitted:	5 May 2005
Lleoliad/Location:	Cardiff City Centre
Disgrifiad o'r Cynllun Scheme Description:	Library with retail
Ymgynghorwyr Cynllunio: Planning Consultants:	Turley Associates
Cleient/Asiant: Client/Agent:	Land Securities [Matt Holman]
Pensaer/Architect:	BDP [John Wakes]
Awdurdod Cynllunio: Planning Authority:	Cardiff City Council
Statws Cynllunio: Planning Status:	Pre-planning
Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/Design Review Panel:	
Alan Francis (cadeirydd/chair) Cindy Harris (swyddog/officer) Geraint John Kedrick Davies	Wendy Hall Ewan Jones Lyn Owen

Cyflwyniad/Presentation

The scheme is progressing towards stage D and it is hoped that a planning application will be submitted in the next few weeks. BDP are about to be commissioned to start work on the interior design.

The basis of the design remains as it was presented to Design Review in February 2005, but some minor changes have been made in the interim. The number of strip roof lights has been reduced to three, for reasons of environmental control. The planned sedum roof has proved expensive, and does not contribute towards an improved BREEAM rating, so will be replaced with standing seam aluminium [Kalzip]. The gridshell roof structure remains expressed internally. The interior space is unsprinklered and will be treated as a single compartment for fire protection. There is a mix of natural and mechanical ventilation with heat recovery, and cooling will be via 100 metre deep boreholes, chilled beams and exposed soffits. The designers are confident of achieving a BREEAM 'Very Good' rating, but have been advised that an 'Excellent' rating would cost a further £0.25m and it is unlikely that funds will be available for this.

The facade treatment remains a combination of solid panels with punched holes, and glazing. Vertical and horizontal solar shading is incorporated. The materials are likely to be powder coated aluminium, coloured glazing, and a brass sheet cladding. Servicing for the library will be from the bus lane to the south of the building, and for the retail units from Mill Lane.

Ymateb y Panel/Panel's Response

The Panel appreciated the progress that has been made on the design development and expressed confidence that the quality of the internal space created will be very good.

We remain concerned at the relative lack of active frontages on Hayes Bridge Road although we recognise that the location of the one-stop shop is a step in the right direction. Nevertheless, there is a real danger of Hayes Bridge Road becoming downgraded to a service road unless more street level animation is introduced. It was suggested that glazing on the lift and/or stairs might go some way towards achieving greater animation. We noted that the refuse bin stores were to be accessed from Hayes Bridge Road and suggested that an internal circulation space should be created allowing access to the refuse storage area from the inside. Similarly, the south facing facade opposite the Marriott Hotel should be as active as possible, preferably with some restaurant window space, and access for refuse handling should be enclosed or internal.

Generally, we judge that the permeability within and around the building is poor and we would like to see more linkages between the library and the retail functions at ground floor. The designer advised that this was difficult for reasons of fire protection, escape, ventilation, security, and ultimately cost. However, the Panel considered that the provision of a generous public space in the entrance / reception area was essential, and strongly supported the idea of losing the wall between retail unit 1 and reception. There should also be direct access from the one-stop shop into the library.

The quality of the cladding system will be crucial to the success of the design as a whole, and sufficient funding and priority needs to be given to materials and the

details and junctions between panels. For instance shadow gaps should be preferred over mullion caps. The quality of cladding at lower level should reflect that at higher level and the Panel were concerned that a change of solid material was suggested but no definite choice had been made. We would like to see continued use of the brass used at higher levels, but perhaps in a thicker and more textured form to provide a more robust finish. Apparently the desired quality of the cladding system is under threat in the cost plan, as are the coffered ceilings. We recommend that in this case the whole cost plan should be restructured to protect quality on the elevations and the entrance space, at the expense, if necessary, of details such as the projecting cantilevered bays.

The Panel commends the environmental measures that have been introduced, such as bore hole cooling, and regrets the loss of the sedum roof and solar photovoltaic panels for reasons of cost. We would like to see some public realm improvement especially on Mill Lane, including weather protection over the retail units.

The procurement route will be single stage Design and Build. The current architects will not be novated. The Panel urged that the design team should not be novated until the end of stage E at least and preferably much later. The quality of the cladding will be crucial in achieving the desired quality and a full architectural involvement in the detailed design and production information for this, pre-novation, is vital to its success.

Crynodeb/Summary

The Panel applauds the progress which has been made on this scheme and recognises that the interior space promises to be exciting and innovative. We are pleased that the current design team will be retained to produce the interior design. However:

- We remain concerned at the lack of active frontages on Hayes Bridge Road
- Internal permeability should be improved at ground floor, with clear linkages between the entrance area on the one hand, and the A3 units and one-stop shop on the other.
- High priority should be given to the quality of the cladding system and how it is procured. If necessary, a radical revision of the cost plan should be carried out to protect the desired quality.
- The design team should be directly employed at least until the end of stage E, and involved in detailed design and production information for the cladding system
- We would ideally like to see some weather protection provided on the west elevation
- The frontage to the south should be kept as active as possible, preferably including restaurant windows, and its servicing function should not be allowed to predominate.
- We commend the environmental features that have been included and regret that this approach could not be taken further

Diwedd/End

NB A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request