

Statws/Status:

Cyhoeddus / Public



**Adroddiad Adolygu Dylunio:
Design Review Report:**

13 April 2005

**Dyddiad Cyfarfod / Cyflwyno'r Deunydd:
Meeting Date / Material Submitted:**

6 April 2005

Lleoliad/Location:

Cardiff City Centre

**Disgrifiad o'r Cynllun
Scheme Description:**

**St Davids 2
Retail, mixed use**

**Cleient/Asiant:
Client/Agent:**

**Land Securities
[Matt Holman, Andrew Dudley]**

**Ymgynghorwyr Cynllunio:
Planning Consultants:**

**Turley Associates
[Craig O'Brien]**

Pensaer/Architect:

**Benoy Ltd
[Graham Izzard, James Utting]**

Landscape architect:

**Hyland Edgar Driver
[David O'Brien]**

**Awdurdod Cynllunio:
Planning Authority:**

**Cardiff County Council
[Helen Hodgson]**

**Statws Cynllunio:
Planning Status:**

**Reserved matters application
submitted**

Y Panel Adolygu Dylunio/Design Review Panel:

**Alan Francis (cadeirydd/chair)
Cindy Harris (swyddog/officer)
Ewan Jones**

**Lyn Owen
Howard Wainwright
John Punter**

Cyflwyniad/Presentation

As this was the fifth time the Panel had seen this project, it was agreed that the presentation should concentrate on fleshing out the details of different parts of the scheme. The design of the corner building on the Hayes and Hills Street has been further refined to present a well mannered, contemporary facade at this important junction. The retail element on this corner rises to 3 storeys and steps down to 2 storeys along the Hayes. The residential block heights also step down and up to respect the buildings opposite and to mark the entrance to Bridge Street arcade. The bridge links on Hills Street and Tredegar Street remain lightweight and fully glazed. A new public square is planned on Bridge Street as a gateway feature. The relationship of the JLP store to the Library and Hayes Bridge Road remains under discussion. The facade of the store will be blonde terracotta cladding and dressed stonework mainly at street levels.

The interior details of the arcades continue to be developed, with connections at each end of the Grand Arcade linking Debenhams to JLP showing a formal geometry and a fully glazed roof over the main intersection with Bridge Street arcade

The design of the public realm is still being developed with further details required by the local authority. Paving materials will be real sandstone (from Yorkshire or abroad), Welsh stone and imported granite, forming a permeable surface designed to mature well. The statue of Mr Bachelor will be re-sited on a plinth and details around tree pits and planters are under discussion. The Hayes will have contrasting paving in the central zone with two kiosks, servicing roughly one third of the space each, at either end. The public conveniences will remain and Hayes island will have steps, distinctive paving using fan setts, and seating in crafted stone or metalwork. A piece of public art is planned on the Hayes at the entrance to Bridge Street arcade. Hayes Place is designed with a slightly sunken semi-circular performance space [no safety balustrading is necessary], tiered seating and water jets. Fixing points for temporary structures and service pits will be built in. The new Bridge Street square will feature trees and public art and form a pedestrianised area extending to the south and west.

The local authority representative outlined the areas with which they still have concerns:

- The ‘prow’ of the JLP building and its relation to the Library (intended to be the major building), Hayes Bridge Road and Hayes Place. They would like to see more fenestration at street level, especially on the east and west facades, to avoid blank, lifeless frontages.
- The bridge links on Hills Street and Tredegar Street are still lacking critical details. The Tredegar Street bridge is 11 metres wide and 11.5 metres high, and questions remain about the nature and quality of the pedestrian area underneath the bridge which is a public space.
- The design of the affordable housing on Barracks Lane should show the same quality of elevational treatment as the residential units on the Hayes, especially as it is adjacent to the Charles Street conservation area.
- The design of the multi-storey car park will be crucial to the success of the east side of St Davids Two and more detail is required of the elevational treatment and materials. In particular the extent of render should be reduced and broken up with more stonework. The setback from the housing is recognised and welcomed.
- The authority would like to see more local distinctiveness in the details of the arcade design, including more variety in the shop fronts and integrated public artwork. The design of the intersection as a major meeting point is not convincing.
- More detail is required on the public realm
- More information is required to show how the eastern end of Tredegar Street will work as a 24 hour street, and how the competing needs of pedestrians, taxis and servicing vehicles will be resolved

- In the public art strategy, a definitive Welsh focus is required. Public art should be incorporated throughout the site and into the arcades, possibly with a major work on Hills Street
- The east edge of the site including Barracks Lane and the open-air market, needs further detailed design, especially with regard to the interface with the servicing area to the rear of Charles Street.

Amendments to the reserved matters application will be presented in early May.

Ymateb y Panel/Panel's Response

The Panel echoed and supported every one of the points raised by the local authority, and would repeat them in roughly the same order of priority. We were surprised and disappointed that so much detail was missing on what is a detailed application. This lack of detail was especially problematic for the car park cladding, the housing elevations, and each of the seven major public spaces. Overall, the Panel supported the general direction in which the design was being developed, but were prevented from making more detailed comments and recommendations by the lack of information.

- We remain unconvinced as to the promised quality of the arcade design from the evidence of the drawings as presented. The relation between roof and wall remains problematic, with the continued unbroken upper fascia still in evidence. The elements should be more fully integrated with the rhythm and verticality carried up from the ground and across the roof. The images presented lack any genuine local distinctiveness or positive reinterpretation of the arcade tradition that we were promised, although previous sketches were encouraging. The architect stated that they had been asked to produce 1:50 details only and were moving towards more detailed design.
- In general the Panel were pleased with the development of the JLP store, which promises elegant and restrained detailing. However, they continue to be extremely concerned at the apparent intention to project John Lewis signage out into the middle of the Hayes. Hayes Bridge Road is still not recognised as the important historical axis that it is, and its importance is growing as the Bay develops and more housing is built along the railway. We agree with the local authority that more animation is needed at ground floor level.
- We feel confident about the general direction of the design of the public realm, but we would like to see more detail and have a separate examination of how each of the main public spaces is to be designed.
- While we understand the commercial need for positive visual links between SD1 and SD2, the Hills Street bridge should be designed to emphasise that it links two city blocks and developments that are thirty years apart. It should allow more visual access up and down Hills Street and be a more delicate and transparent structure.
- We would like to see more detail on the design of the kiosks on the Hayes and offered to provide material on similar structures in Sydney which have been successful (designed by Cox Richardson for J C Decaux as part of a bespoke set of furniture for the City of Sydney) and also more detail on the open market proposals
- The analysis of the shadowing and microclimatic effects on the Hayes, particularly Hayes Island and the marketplace, needs further explanation and the submitted drawings are inadequate in this regard.
- Proposals for Cathedral Square are a disappointment, indicating only five trees and some seating. We were informed that improvements and refurbishment to SD1 are being planned and we would look to see more active frontages and less heavy arcading here in future.

- The general site planning and massing of the housing elements have been improved, but the facades, gable end views and fenestration details require further finessing. We commend a more whole-hearted pursuit of the precedent examples of elevations shown on page 13 of the Vision Statement. It is important to enliven these facades with balconies and generous fenestration, and to take advantage of the corners to provide double aspects. We are more reassured that the roof gardens will provide accessible and useful amenity space.
- We would like to see more detail on the social housing component (which might be low cost private housing, or operated by a Housing Association). The current proposals show the housing located hard against the service ramp to the multi-storey car park
- The palette of materials needs further definition, together with textures and colours. We were delighted that real sandstone will be used on the retail facades with slate at the base of the columns at pedestrian level.
- More detail is required on lighting, signage and public art. The Commission would like to participate in the formulation of the public art strategy. A suggestion was made for some artefact commemorating the Cardiff born explorer, T.W.E. David.
- The Panel stressed the importance of providing a clear, safe pedestrian route along Tredegar Street, particularly for movement late at night.
- The proposed three storey Marriott car park on the corner of Custom House Street and Mill Lane is not a welcome development. We suggest that it could go from 3.5 to 4 storeys if, in the process, some street level animation could be provided and if a better site could not be found elsewhere. The Marriott should be taking the opportunity to reorient its function rooms towards the surrounding streets and to make a more positive contribution to the locality.
- We were pleased to see the continuous canopy on the Hayes. We were told that it will probably be 3 metres high and 1.5 metres wide, but that mockups will be built and tested on site.
- Sustainability issues are still not addressed in any coherent way.

Crynodeb/Summary

The Panel are pleased to have the opportunity of a continuing review on this important scheme and wish to remain involved in the forthcoming discussions concerning detailed design. We welcome the promise of further work on and refinement of presented material, while remaining frustrated at the lack of current material on which to comment. The following are our main areas of concern, as expressed in more detail above:

- The design and detailing of the arcades
- The JLP 'prow' and projecting signage
- The quality of Cathedral Square
- The massing and detailing of the Barracks Lane housing
- The residential elevations on the Hayes and the detailing of the canopy
- The Marriott car park
- The bridge links, especially their width and transparency, and especially on Hills Street where the important east west views are blocked.
- Lighting, signage and public art

Diwedd/End

NB A Welsh language copy of this report is available upon request.